

Estimates Committee G

Report to the Legislative Assembly

Introduction

On 3 June 2009, in accordance with Standing Order 167(3), the Legislative Assembly appointed Estimates Committee G. It ordered the committee to investigate and report on the proposed expenditure contained in the Appropriation Bill 2009 for organisational units within the portfolios of the:

- Minister for Education and Training; and
- Minister for Child Safety and Minister for Sport.

The Appropriation Bill authorises the Treasurer to pay an identified amount (the vote amount) from the consolidated fund for departments for the financial years starting 1 July 2007 (clause 4(1)), 1 July 2009 (clause 2(1)) and 1 July 2010 (clause 3). The bill provides for the amount paid to a department to include the amount already authorised by section 3 of the Appropriation Act 2008 to be paid for the financial year starting 1 July 2009 (clause 2(3)).

For each department, clause 2(2) and schedule 2 of the bill provide that the vote amount:

- is appropriated for the financial year for the department to be applied to its departmental services, administered items and equity adjustment as stated; and
- includes amounts for departmental services, administered items and equity adjustment delivered by the department in the financial year starting 1 July 2008 but for which the department has not been paid in that financial year.

Accordingly, the matter on which the committee reports is whether the proposed expenditures for the two portfolios be agreed to.

COMMITTEE EXAMINATION OF PROPOSED EXPENDITURE

On 6 July 2009, Estimates Committee G provided each Minister with twenty questions on notice and received responses to these questions on 22 July 2009.

On 23 July 2009, the committee conducted a public hearing to take oral evidence from the Minister for Education and Training, and the Minister for Child Safety and Minister for Sport. A Hansard transcript of the committee's hearing can be accessed at:

www.parliament.qld.gov.au/Hansard/

The committee has considered the estimates referred to it by examining information contained in:

- the Appropriation Bill 2009;
- the Queensland Government 2009-10 State Budget Papers;
- answers to pre-hearing questions on notice;
- oral evidence taken at the hearing; and
- documents tabled at the hearing.

REPORT OF COMMITTEE

This report sets out the committee's findings on the proposed expenditure contained in the Appropriation Bill for organisational units within the two relevant portfolios. Each portfolio is considered below.

An additional volume of information tabled with the report contains:

- questions on notice;
- answers to questions on notice received from the respective ministers prior to the hearing;
- additional material provided at the hearing; and
- minutes of committee meetings.

MINISTER FOR EDUCATION AND TRAINING

Schedule 1 to the bill would authorise the Treasurer to make the following payment to the Department of Education and Training:

Department	Budget	Est. Actual	Vote
	2008–2009	2008–2009	2009-2010
	\$'000	\$'000	\$'000
Department of Education and Training (formerly Education, Training and the Arts)	7 390 199	7 811 690	10 363 827

Schedule 2 provides further:

Department	Budget 2008–2009 \$'000	Est. Actual 2008–2009 \$'000	Budget 2009–2010 \$'000
Department of Education and Training			
Controlled Items			
Departmental Services	5 101 469	5 507 920	6 666 656
Equity Adjustment	288 301	281 144	1 259 691
Administered Items	2 000 429	2 022 626	2 437 480
Vote	7 390 199	7 811 690	10 363 827

The Queensland Government 2009-10 State Budget Papers (Service Delivery Statements, 3-99 to 3-155) provide an overview of the department:

The Department of Education and Training and the Office for Early Childhood Education and Care report to the Minister for Education and Training.

Recent Machinery of Government changes established the Office for Early Childhood Education and Care from 1 January 2009, and transferred Arts Queensland and related statutory authorities to the Department of the Premier and Cabinet on 26 March 2009.

The Service Delivery Statement provides that the Department of Education and Training pursues three strategic objectives:

- laying strong educational foundations;
- developing skills for the economy; and
- giving children a flying start.

In respect of 2009-10 highlights, the budget papers (Service Delivery Statements, 3-101 to 3-105) include:

Laying strong educational foundations

- \$20.3 million in 2009-10 for the Literacy and Numeracy Action Plan, including additional teachers, coaches and summer schools to provide assistance to students and schools not meeting the literacy and numeracy national standards, and to provide professional development to teachers:
- \$11.1 million in 2009-10 for the Science Spark program to provide 100 additional science teachers in years 4 to 7, professional development for primary teachers, an expansion in the number of Earth Smart Science Schools, and declaring 2010 as the year of Environmental Sustainability in Schools;

\$301 million for the State Schools of Tomorrow program;

Teaching and Learning

- \$4.5 million to provide additional 5,000 teacher aide hours per week;
- \$7.5 million to provide \$10,000 additional funding per school, and an extra \$3,000 for schools in disadvantaged areas;
- \$3 million for the continued implementation of the Queensland Curriculum Assessment and Reporting Framework for years 1 to 9;
- \$2.8 million for the Every Child Counts pilot program;
- \$1.2 million for the Edmund Rice Bridge Program to provide assistance for youths returning from the juvenile justice system who are at risk of disengaging from education and other social connections;

Developing skills for the economy

- \$203 million to develop skills of apprentices and trainees;
- \$343 million to provide priority training through TAFE institutes and the Australian Agricultural College Corporation;
- \$2.7 million for the Training Initiatives for Indigenous Adults in Regional and Remote Communities Program;
- \$1.6 million to support Indigenous students and their families from the Torres Strait, Cape York and Palm Island who are studying away from home;

Giving a child a flying start

- \$15.4 million for additional kindergarten services;
- implementation of a whole of government strategy to attract and retain diverse and highly trained childhood services workforce;
- \$16.7 million for pre-prep early learning programs in 35 Indigenous communities; and
- a review of the Child Care Act 2002.

The committee's examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio included examination by way of questions on notice and questions without notice at the hearing on 23 July 2009. The matters examined in this way are outlined below. Further detail is contained in the additional information volume.

Questions on notice

Matters examined included:

- the OneSchool program;
- investment in kindergartens;
- Every Child Counts funding for disadvantaged schools and the criteria for the funding;
- funding for the Building the Education Revolution;
- ensuring reasonable class sizes;
- staffing in Queensland schools;
- alternative learning programs;
- educational infrastructure to provide modern learning environments for all Queensland students;
- the quality of Queensland teachers;
- creation and support of places for vulnerable apprentices and trainees;
- support provided to teachers in rural and remote areas;
- TAFE facilities including enrolments, staff and courses;
- funding for capital works and unfinished projects;
- budget for the State Schools of Tomorrow program;
- employment status of additional teachers and teacher aides;
- classification level of teachers; and
- cancellation and suspension of apprenticeships.

Questions without notice

Matters examined during the hearing included:

- Schools
 - staff levels and vacancies:
 - staff remuneration:
 - student attendance levels;
 - violence and bullying;
 - class sizes;
 - maintenance of buildings;
 - extra facilities and equipment;
 - literacy and numeracy standards;
- Early education and care
 - universal access to kindergarten;
 - child safety in early childhood care;
 - qualifications of staff;

- collapse of ABC childcare centres and support to affected families;
- Capital Works programs
 - federal funding for new facilities;
 - future maintenance of new facilities;
 - provision of staff for new facilities;
 - energy and water efficiency initiatives;
- Indigenous education matters
 - closing the gap on Indigenous education disparity;
 - initiatives for Indigenous students;
 - decline in attendance of Indigenous students in prep-year;
 - decline in reading, writing and numeracy standards of year 2 Indigenous students;

TAFE

- improvement of facilities;
- additional training places;
- funding, staff and administrative structure;
- Apprentices and Trainees
 - school based apprenticeships and traineeships;
 - support and initiatives for apprentices and trainees:
 - the Out-of-Trade register; and
 - skills shortage in key industry sectors.

MINISTER FOR CHILD SAFETY AND MINISTER FOR SPORT

Schedule 1 to the bill would authorise the Treasurer to make the following payment to the Department of Communities:

Department	Budget 2008–2009 \$'000	Est. Actual 2008–2009 \$'000	Vote 2009– 2010 \$'000
Department of Communities	892 420	1 474 598	4 685 756

Schedule 2 provides further:

Department	Budget 2008–2009 \$'000	Est. Actual 2008–2009 \$'000	Budget 2009– 2010 \$'000
Department of Co	Department of Communities		
Controlled Items			
Departmental services	522 895	1 047 366	3 237 559
Equity Adjustment	88 457	122 748	1 178 741
Administered Items	281 068	304 781	269 456
<u>Vote</u>	<u>892 420</u>	<u>1 474 895</u>	4 685 756

The Department of Communities provided the appropriation for the Minister for Child Safety and Minister for Sport as:

Portfolio	Est. Actual 2008–2009 \$'000	Budget 2009–2010 \$'000	
Minister for Child Safety and Minister for Sport			
Controlled Items			
Departmental services	218 662	768 864	
Equity Adjustment	6 157	20 724	
Administered Items	3 776	37 575	
<u>Vote</u>	<u>228 595</u>	<u>827 163</u>	

The Queensland Government 2009-10 State Budget Papers (Service Delivery Statements, 3-1 to 3-99) state:

The Department of Communities has four Ministers, each with discrete portfolio responsibilities...The Ministers work closely together on issues of common interest to their portfolios.

The budget papers state further (Service Delivery Statements, 3-2):

Following machinery-of-Government changes in March 2009, a number of former departments and entities were brought together to form the new Department of Communities to provide and fund a broad range of services with common objectives, including housing and homelessness services; community and youth justice services; child safety services; disability, home and community care, and community mental health services; sport and reacreation services; multicultural services; women's services; and Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander services.

It goes on to say:

The new department's 'whole of agency' objectives are:

- better services and pathways for clients
- more inclusive, active and safe communities
- a more sustainable human service system that delivers better value.

In respect of Child Safety, 2009-10 highlights, the budget papers (Service Delivery Statement, 3-4) indicate:

- \$25.3 for improvements in the diversity and stability of placements for children in care;
- \$0.49 million to provide Indigenous youth mentoring services to reduce the number of children and youth entering the statutory child protection and youth justice systems;
- \$9.9 million to provide safe houses in Indigenous communities which will allow Indigenous children who are taken into care to remain within their communities;
 and
- \$15.5 million for Family Intervention Services.

Highlights for Sport and Recreation in the 2009-10 budget papers (Service Delivery Statement 3-7 to 3-8) indicate:

- \$53 million to improve sport and recreational facilities across Queensland;
- \$1 million to the Healthy Queensland Awards;
- \$4 million to the Queensland Police Citizens Youth Welfare Association to improve sport and recreation opportunities in Indigenous communities;
- \$11.8 million for the Sport and Recreation Development Program; and
- \$2.5 million for the Dunlop Townsville 400 V8 event.

The committee's examination of the proposed expenditure for the portfolio included examination by way of questions on notice and questions without notice at the hearing on 23 July 2009. The matters examined in this way are outlined below. Further detail is contained in the additional information volume.

Questions on notice

Matters examined included:

Child Safety

- Funding for safe houses in Indigenous communities;
- staff turnover;
- Queensland Industrial Relations Commission increase in award for Community services workers;
- staff caseloads for 2007, 2008 and 2009 (to date);
- budget allocations and staffing levels for child safety zones and central office;
- Integrated Client Management System;
- retaining a community and cultural connection for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander children in care;
- the Child Safety Services Foster Care Recruitment Campaign;
- the number of deaths of children known to Child Safety Services;
- Services for Children and Young People in Care and sexual abuse counselling;
- health passports and education plans for children living away from home; and
- confidentiality provisions in Child Safety legislation.

Sport and Recreation

- grants to sporting associations;
- grant to Stadiums Queensland;
- Gold Coast Stadium redevelopment; and
- participation in sport and active recreation programs.

Questions without notice

Matters examined at the hearing included:

Child Safety

- Children in child protection
 - the number of Indigenous children in care with sexually transmitted infections;
 - the number of child deaths where the child was known to Child Safety Services;
 - unsupervised accommodation for 'difficult' children;
 - children in care missing for 24 hours or more;
 - the increase in out-of-home care;
 - the Health Passport Scheme;
 - reporting obligations under the Child Protection Act:

- review of case plans for children on protection orders and in out of home care;
- the number of parents who committed suicide following removal of a child;
- Indigenous youth mentoring service;
- closing the gap on Indigenous disadvantage;
- Family Intervention Services;
- assistance to children under a protection order;
- sexual abuse by siblings;

Staffing

- front-line services;
- caseloads;
- mandatory training of front-line staff;
- career progression for front-line staff;
- emotional and physical support for front-line staff;
- the role of service delivery staff;

Carers

- Foster carer recruitment campaign;
- training of new carers, and the funding of that training;
- increase in Indigenous carers;
- One Chance at Childhood initiative;
- Funding of central office and Child Safety service centres;
- Child Safety Services reform;
- Growing demand for Child Safety Services;
- Access to child abuse phone services;
- Partnerships of Child Safety Services with other agencies and with the non-government sector;

Sport

- Stadiums Queensland
 - projected loss;
 - funding for Cararra Stadium;
- the decline in schools accessing sport and recreation programs;
- Commonwealth Games bid;
- Grants and subsidies to sporting associations;
- funding to promote volunteers in sport;
- feedback from QSport conference;
- actions to achieve fair and healthy Q2 targets;

- Townsville V8 Supercar race; and
- Sport and Recreation Disaster Assistance program.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

The committee has investigated the proposed expenditure contained in the Appropriation Bill 2009 for organisational units within the portfolios of the:

Minister for Education and Training; and

Fac Latterlule

• Minister for Child Safety and Minister for Sport.

The committee recommends that the proposed expenditure for the portfolios be agreed to by the Legislative Assembly without amendment.

Mr Steve Wettenhall MP

<u>Chair</u>

August 2009

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE G MEMBERSHIP

Mr Steve Wettenhall MP (Chair) Member for Barron River Mrs Liz Cunningham MP (Deputy Chair) Member for Gladstone

Mr Jack Dempsey MP Member for Bundaberg

Dr Bruce Flegg MP Member for Moggill

Mr Mark Ryan MP Member for Morayfield

Mrs Desley Scott MP Member for Woodridge

Mr Murray Watt MP Member for Everton

SECRETARIAT

Ms Jo Mathers (Research Director)

Ms Amanda Honeyman (Research Officer)

Ms Genevieve Molineux (Executive Assistant to 17 July 2009)

Ms Jenny North (Executive Assistant from 20 July 2009)

Estimates Committee G

2009

Statements of Reservation

<u>STATEMENT OF RESERVATION – COMMITTEE G</u>

Education and Training Submitted by Dr Bruce Flegg

I have a number of reservations relating to Estimates Committee G that I express herein.

I would also like to place on record my thanks to the Committee Chair Mr Steve Wettenhall MP who I think did a very good job, and committee staff, Jo Mathers, Amanda Honeyman, Genevieve Molineux and Jenny North.

General comments on the Estimates Process

The Estimates Committee process is intended to be an effective scrutiny of the Government's expenditure, but once again this year has shown major deficiencies in the process.

Overall, the Estimates process did not allow for the clarification of education and training expenditure, but merely highlighted a number of areas that require significantly more attention and scrutiny.

Attendance

Attendance is a basic educational indicator. Without ensuring attendance there is little chance of getting children engaged with their education.

The Minister was unable to answer basic questions about compiling of data to identify problem areas.

Doubts remain over published figures which do not appear a true reflection of attendance.

Without careful and meaningful review of attendance how can the Government address this vital area?

Asbestos

Asbestos remains a problem in our schools.

Given we know how toxic this deadly substance is if it becomes airborne I am amazed and disappointed by the lack of response to degraded and damaged asbestos flooring. The example of Chapel Hill State School was presented to the Committee.

It should not be necessary to publicly embarrass the Government to get timely and safe removal of damaged asbestos materials.

Building Education Revolution (BER)

The Federally funded – State administered BER is a once in a generation opportunity in capital works for schools.

The LNP does not want to see this as a lost opportunity and has consistently tried to hold the State Government accountable on it.

Three areas of concern:

- Lack of value for money. The poor administration of the scheme means that much of the funding doesn't end up a built project in schools.
- Lack of regard for individual school needs means many projects don't reflect the true local needs. LNP unashamedly urges the Government to listen and allow local schools and committees a much greater say. This is the only way to get true educational and community value for what we are spending.

Mt Crosby State School was presented to the committee as an example. The challenge to the Govt is to ensure schools and committees get what they need.

Where are the extra teachers and extra maintenance budget?

It is not just about new buildings... without staff for new libraries, science labs, computer centres, indoor sporting facilities etc. we are only meeting part of the need.

The Minister when questioned appeared to confirm no extra staff would be employed.

Likewise already meager school maintenance budgets will have billions of dollars of additional buildings to maintain.

The Minister did not indicate additional maintenance budgets when asked.

Federal government is <u>ONLY</u> funding capital with recurrent expenditure in staffing facilities and maintaining them falls to the State and may prove to be the achilles heel in getting real value out of the spend.

Digital Education Revolution

Value of computers in technology education and education in general is unquestioned.

However LNP has serious concerns that:

- Not enough of the money is finding its way into school technology
- The Government trust schools to administer their DER projects directly and ensure we get more 'bang for the buck'

Training

The Government has committed to nearly 150,000 extra training places.

Examination of the facts makes this look like 'a cruel illusion' at best, outright deception at the worst.

Declining apprenticeships, stagnant forecasts for the number of positions, stagnant budget allocations and stagnant staffing numbers were all pointed out to the Committee.

Training places looks to be an area in crisis and the budget clearly doesn't reflect the increases the Government promised.

State Schools of Tomorrow (SSOT)

The State Schools of Tomorrow program has been 'looted' by the Government to prop up routine maintenance and other budgets.

Otherwise SSOT is a program of school <u>closures</u> and the creation of mega primary schools.

LNP concerns include:-

- Lack of public debate about Government policy of shifting students to big schools.
- Lack of educational research to show this would give better outcomes (in fact research suggests the opposite).

The closure of first rate smaller schools like Blackstone is a retrograde step. It takes away a smaller school option for parents and appears to be for Government (ease of administration) rather than any genuine cost saving.

The Government has failed to make the case for closure at all. They have not even put a figure on expected savings. Communities deserve better. In any case the LNP believes cost savings are not likely to be huge and the cost to education and parental choice will be high.

The Government need to come clean about SSOT. We want to see a proper business case and an educational assessment of school amalgamations and closures.

Teacher vacancies

It beggars belief that there is only one permanent teacher vacancy in the whole of Queensland!

This rings alarm bells to the LNP about management of our most valuable resource – our teachers.

With chronic shortages in science, maths, manual arts, home economics, IT etc what is the Minister doing to get appropriate teacher numbers in these areas?

Federal funding disappears into the ether of State bureaucracy

Federal funding of \$100 per students to primary schools to address budget shortfalls to these schools has not been passed on by the State Government.

The Minister was unable or unwilling to explain why or what has happened to this funding under questioning.

This again raised the spectre that too little of valuable and scarce taxpayer funding of education is actually getting to the coalface in our schools.

We cannot afford to have large amounts of our scarce education money diverted away to an inefficient central bureaucracy.

The LNP believes this money should have been directed to schools as intended by the Federal Government.

Indigenous Education

Serious holes were demonstrated to the Committee in dealing with indigenous disadvantage in education.

The LNP is keen to see us 'bridge the gap' in indigenous education.

I am concerned that basic skills of literacy and numeracy are not improving and may even be deteriorating.

Indigenous attendance at Prep is declining while the rest of the community has embraced Prep.

The LNP considers it a basic obligation to give indigenous children the same chances in life as all other groups.

Major backflip on Kindy teachers

The Minister under questioning appeared to back away from the policy that children in kindergartens be 'taught' by a university trained early childhood teacher.

Again this was without public debate and ignores the importance all educational research places on play based early childhood learning.

Summer Schools

The Minister seemed to know little (or at least not willing to share it with Queenslanders) about how the proposed summer schools will get the most struggling and disadvantaged students to attend on a voluntary basis during holidays?

This will need a strategy if those in greatest need of literacy and numeracy help are to be engaged during holidays.

In general they are already the most likely to be absent or disengaged. There may be benefit from summer schools but only if effectively targeted to need.

Bruce Flegg

Member for Moggill

Shadow Minister for Education and Training

STATEMENT OF RESERVATION

Child Safety and Sport

Secretary of Committee G

I refer to the report for Estimates Committee G and submit a statement of reservations on the report and some general comments on the process of Estimates Committees hearings.

General comments on the Estimates Process

The Estimates Process is the greatest opportunity for parliamentary scrutiny of Government appropriations in a unicameral system and it is unfortunate the process does not allow for well considered deliberations by parliamentary committees such as this one.

The inherent processes of the Estimates process fail to provide the level of scrutiny of the Government's use of taxpayer's money.

The limited number of questions without notice allocated to each Minister fails to ensure that committee members have the opportunity to prepare adequately for the Committee's hearings particularly in areas where the budget papers provide very little information.

The limiting of information to these Estimates Committees, both in terms of the limited useful information in the Budget Papers, as well as the limited number of questions on notice does not in any way assist the committee's work.

In addition to the information available to the committee prior to the committee's hearings, there is limited time for members of the committee to gain detailed information from Ministers during the process.

During this session there has been a continuance of the disturbing trend of Ministers failing to answer specific questions from some committee members, instead giving a very general answer, which had been pre-prepared, about Government directions or policies.

As a result I have very significant reservations about how informed the Committee's report is.

Child Safety Services

With consideration complete for the Child Safety portfolio the following reservations are held –

- Reservations are held about the lack of transparent reporting for the Child Safety budget and how it is being spent.
- The budget papers indicate that only nine new staff has been budgeted for in the 2009/10 budget, which is less than the estimated actual amount for 2008/09.
- By the Ministers own admissions the department of child safety has not provided up to date figures on which to assess the forward estimates.
- Strong reservations are held about the lack of reporting and record keeping by Child Safety Services in light of the lack of centralised reporting on legislative requirements.
- Reservations are held about the lack of funding being allocated to early intervention and family support services.
- Serious concerns are held about the record number of deaths of children who are known to Child Safety Services 79 in 2008/09.
- Even more concerns are held about the attitude and response by the Minister to this alarming figure. Reservations are held about the excuses put forward by the Minister to the alarming number of deaths, and there was no commitment by the Minister to at least try to reduce the number of child deaths.
- Reservations are held about Child Safety Services ability to retain staff, there was no clear indication in either the budget papers or the committee hearing as to the exact number of staff separations.
- It is concerning that the Estimates hearing confirmed that new staff are handling case files without adequate training.
- Reservations are held about the Minister's failure to know if children coming into care have sexually transmitted infections or if children in care are being tested for the H1N1 virus or if any children have tested positive. This lack of central data on these serious health issues places children's lives at risk.

- The estimates hearing revealed that despite record numbers of foster carers being recruited, a significant number of carers also left Child Safety Services.
- For a Minister responsible for child safety it is very concerning that he was unable to explain or at least attempt to explain why, as indicated through his Departments on performance reports, Indigenous Children are twice as likely to be victims of child sexual abuse as other Queensland children.
- Even more concerning is the lack of detail provided in the budget papers or the hearing as how many children are accessing counseling services for problem sexual behaviour.
- Strong reservations are held over the level of bureaucracy within Child Safety Services.
- There is serious concern raised by indications that 12 Child Safety Service Centres may have their operating budgets cut in 2009/10.
- The estimates process has again highlighted the failure of this government to deliver much needed infrastructure to Child Safety Services with significant under spend in services to indigenous communities as well as additional therapeutic respite centres.
- There is little indication from the budget papers or the Estimates hearing as to additional support for children with high needs in care.
- Overall the Estimates process for Child Safety Services lacked transparency and openness and it is clear there is a lack of direction, understanding and support from the Minister, which raises serious reservations for the Department's ability to meet its service obligations in the coming financial year and this Governments lack of focus on protecting vulnerable children.

With consideration complete for the Sport portfolio the following reservations are held –

Sport

- In response to Stadiums Queensland's \$80 million funding disappearance, confirmed by the Government in April of this year, it is very concerning that the Minister gave no real indication that the Government was going to ensure such mismanagement of taxpayers money doesn't occur again.
- It was very disappointing that the Shadow Minister for Sport was only able
 to ask questions for 15 minutes, providing the Opposition with very little
 chance to hold the Government open and accountable in such a vital area
 for Queensland.
- The Estimates process has failed to allow for any real analysis of the expenditures detailed in the Queensland Budget Statements for Sport in particular.
- Despite numerous follow up questions and repeating the question the Minister simply read prepared unrelated statements on subjects not related to the issues raised in the estimates process.
- The budget papers were significantly reduced in detail from previous years and lacked transparency in reporting the allocated funding to Stadiums Queensland and for other vital sports infrastructure.
- It was extremely disappointing the Minster seemed to care very little about a 9% drop in schools participating in the Active Recreation Programme.
- The Minister used symbolic and meaningless statements such as making "Queenslanders Australia's Healthiest people" but refused to outline his plan or strategy to see that become reality.

Signed

Jack Dempsey

Member for Bundaberg

J. M. Languez.

Shadow Minister for Child Safety and Sport