



Estimates Committee G 2010

Report to the Legislative Assembly

INTRODUCTION

On 20 May 2010, the Legislative Assembly referred to Estimates Committee G the proposed expenditure in the Appropriation Bill 2010 for the following portfolios for examination and report:

- The Minister for Police, Corrective Services and Emergency Services;
- The Minister for Tourism and Fair Trading; and
- The Minister for Climate Change and Sustainability.

The Appropriation summary for 2010–2011 for the units being reported on by the committee is in the table below.

	Budget 2009–10 \$'000	Est. Actual 2009–10 \$'000	Vote 2010–11 \$'000
Department of Police	1,760,448	1,720,529	1,851,175
Department of Community Safety	1,452,591	1,382,794	1,280,157
Minister for Tourism and Fair Trading		116,392	111,741
Minister for Climate Change and Sustainability		437,057	414,635

Source: Appropriation Bill 2010

Accordingly, the matter on which the committee reports is whether the proposed expenditures for the three portfolios be agreed to.

COMMITTEE EXAMINATION OF PROPOSED EXPENDITURE

On 30 June 2010, Estimates Committee G provided each Minister with twenty questions on notice and received responses to those questions on 21 July 2010.

On 22 July 2010, the committee conducted a public hearing to take oral evidence from the Minister for Police, Corrective Services and Emergency Services; the Minister for Tourism and Fair Trading; and the Acting Minister for Climate Change and Sustainability. A Hansard transcript of the committee's hearing can be accessed at: www.parliament.qld.gov.au/Hansard/

THE COMMITTEE HAS CONSIDERED THE ESTIMATES REFERRED TO IT BY EXAMINING INFORMATION CONTAINED IN:

- the Appropriation Bill 2010;
- the Queensland Government 2010-11 State Budget Papers;
- answers to pre-hearing questions on notice;
- oral evidence taken at the hearing;
- documents tabled at the hearing; and
- answers to questions taken on notice at the hearing.

REPORT OF COMMITTEE

This report sets out the committee's findings on the proposed expenditure contained in the Appropriation Bill 2010 for organisational units within the three relevant portfolios. Each portfolio is considered below.

An additional volume of information tabled with the report contains:

- questions on notice;
- answers to questions on notice received from the respective ministers prior to the hearing;
- additional material provided at the hearing;
- questions taken on notice at the hearing and answers to those questions provided after the hearing; and
- minutes of committee meetings.

MINISTER FOR POLICE, CORRECTIVE SERVICES AND EMERGENCY SERVICES

The Minister for Police, Corrective Services and Emergency Services has responsibility for both the Department of Police and the Department of Community Safety (DCS). DCS comprises Queensland Corrective Services (QCS), Emergency Management Queensland (EMQ), the Queensland Fire and Rescue Service (QFRS), the Queensland Ambulance Service (QAS), the State Emergency Service (SES) and Rural Fire volunteers.

DEPARTMENT OF POLICE

The following table details the appropriation for 2010-11 compared to the previous financial year.

	2009-10 \$'000	2010-11 \$'000
Controlled Items		
<i>Departmental Services</i>	1,636,753	1,736,205
<i>Equity Adjustment</i>	83,347	114,529
Administered Items	429	441
Vote	1,720,529	1,851,175

Source: Appropriation Bill 2010

Key funding initiatives for the Department of Police in 2010-11, include:

- 203 additional police positions as part of a three year Government commitment to deliver 600 new positions;
- \$50 million for continued development of a state of the art Police Academy at Wacol;
- \$32.2 million to construct new, refurbished and upgraded facilities across the State including:
 - \$10 million for the new Badu Island Police Station;
 - \$1.3 million for the new Oxley district forensic facility; and
 - \$2 million for the new district support facility in Townsville;
 - \$11 million for the upgrade and/or refurbishment of facilities across the State;
 - \$8.3 million for the replacement of the Mareeba Police Station and Watchhouse, Murgon Police Station and Watchhouse, Camp Hill Police Station, Lockhart River Police Station and the Sunshine Coast District Water Police Facility;
- \$50.2 million for a range of information technology initiatives, including:
 - Developing and implementing a replacement Weapons Licensing System;
 - Progressing QPS Computer Aided Dispatch systems;
 - Introducing a digital integrated traffic camera system to replace the existing infringement back office system; and
 - Roll out digital red light and speed cameras.
- investment of \$22.7 million to support the continued deployment of speed cameras throughout Queensland aimed at reducing road trauma.

- \$400,000 for the second year of an ongoing initiative to extend the "One Punch Can Kill" campaign to reduce assault among young people.

ISSUES CONSIDERED BY THE COMMITTEE

Issues the committee raised with the Minister at the public hearing on 22 July 2010 included:

- The Department of Police capital works program, including – the new Training Academy at Wacol and other new police stations across the State;
- Taskforce Argos;
- Traffic Police staffing levels;
- QPS internal disciplinary processes, procedures and timeframes for resolving disciplinary matters;
- Operational police numbers compared to administrative roles;
- QPS Telephone Interception capabilities;
- Police professional standards and ethical practices;
- Trialling of new technologies including the new Taser Cam;
- Police remuneration and superannuation;
- The reappointment process for the Police Commissioner;
- QPS – CMC relationship;
- Police resources and air capabilities;
- The new Policelink contact centre;
- Queensland road toll;
- Activities of Taskforce Hydra;
- Minimising harm to police officers;
- Use of DNA technology in solving crimes;
- Roadside Drug Testing Unit;
- Number and rate of good order offences;
- Weapon Licensing fees;
- QPS ICT initiatives;
- Police to population ratio;
- Improving public safety;
- Major drug raids and the fight against illicit drug use in the community; and
- Combating outlaw motorcycle gangs.

DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY SAFETY

The following table details the appropriation for 2010-11 compared to the previous financial year.

	2009-10 \$'000	2010-11 \$'000
Controlled Items		
<i>Departmental Services</i>	1,094,082	1,153,941
<i>Equity Adjustment</i>	288,712	126,216
Administered Items	-	-
Vote	1,382,794	1,280,157

Source: Appropriation Bill 2010

Key funding initiatives for the Department of Community Safety in 2010-11, include:

- the recruitment of 75 additional ambulance officers;
- the recruitment of 24 additional operational firefighters;
- completion of the new fire station at Agnes Water and a new service through the construction of new fire and rescue stations at Ripley and Brassall to replace the existing Ipswich fire station;
- the replacement or redevelopment of seven fire stations;
- enhancing disaster management training;
- continuing provision of funding to support the Volunteer Marine Rescue Association Queensland and the Australian Volunteer Coast Guard Association;
- enhancing community safety from bushfires through designation of Neighbourhood Safer Places and rolling out nationally revised fire danger rating signs;
- commencing a program to progressively enhance the energy and water efficiency of fire and rescue stations and vehicles;
- undertaking a range of initiatives to reduce the carbon footprint of correctional centres;
- enhancing Probation and Parole presence in the community to prevent offenders from re-offending;
- \$1.5 million to continue the delivery of the sexual offending treatment programs to prisoners;
- \$3.2 million to complete ongoing maintenance of the Townsville based Bell 412 helicopter;
- enhancing the engineering program to maximise availability of the helicopter fleet with continued additional engineering staff for EMQ to meet demand expectations;
- completion of the construction of an integrated Queensland Emergency Operations Centre at Kedron;
- commencing design for the \$7 million Spring Hill emergency service complex including redevelopment of the ambulance station;
- \$1.2 million to continue ongoing improvements to Queensland Combined Emergency Services Academy;
- commencing strategic land acquisitions to meet the needs of the Queensland Community (\$1.7 million to ambulance services and \$1.2 million to fire and rescue services);
- \$168.6 million to continue construction of the new South Queensland Correctional Precinct development at Gatton and the expansion and redevelopment of Lotus Glen Correctional Centre;
- continuing to closely monitor dangerous offenders with intensive supervision and dedicated surveillance;
- electronic monitoring and partnerships with other agencies, and return offenders who breach conditions of custody if necessary;
- the launch of a Social Responsibility Charter setting out the commitment to rehabilitating offenders;
- funding six new ambulance stations at Ashgrove/The Gap, Coomera, Ningi, Pinjarra Hills, Springfield and North Lakes and the replacement, redevelopment or refurbishment of 14 other stations;
- \$5.8 million to commence planning and purchase of ambulance staff housing in the Surat and Bowen Basins and \$120,000 to construct a new SES building in Mitchell and \$30,000 to fit out the SES building in Surat;
- enhancing the Emergency Services Computer Aided Dispatch (ESCAD) system;
- \$18.5 million to purchase 165 new or replacement ambulance vehicles; and
- \$10.9 million for 23 new or replacement urban fire appliances and \$4.4 million for 25 rural fire appliances.

ISSUES CONSIDERED BY THE COMMITTEE

Issues the committee raised with the Minister at the public hearing on 22 July 2010 include:

- Functions of the Queensland Parole Board;
- Integrated Offender Management System;
- The death of a trainee at the Corrective Services Academy at Wacol;
- Fire and Rescue staff to population ratio;
- The roll out of the ESCAD system;
- Emergency Services and Corrective Services capital works program;

- DCS payroll system;
- QAS and Department of Health working relationships;
- Funding for the Volunteer Marine Rescue Association Queensland and the Australian Volunteer Coast Guard Association;
- Queensland Corrective Services – social responsibility charter;
- The Lost-Time Injury Frequency Rate;
- Staffing levels in the QAS;
- Resources for the Rural Fire Brigades Association;
- Recruitment and training of QFRS officers;
- QFRS capital works program;
- Funding for Surf Life Saving Queensland;
- Preparation and planning for natural disaster events;
- Energy and water saving initiatives within DCS; and
- The Queensland Emergency Operations Centre.

PORTFOLIO OF THE MINISTER FOR TOURISM AND FAIR TRADING

The Department of Employment, Economic Development and Innovation (DEEDI) leads the Government's drive to develop a globally competitive, sustainable Queensland economy and is responsible for creating an environment that supports fair, safe and equitable business practices that match market and community expectations (SDS 2-2).

Within the greater DEEDI structure, the Minister of the Tourism and Fair Trading is responsible for Tourism Queensland, the Office of Fair Trading (OFT), the Office of Liquor, Gaming and Racing (OLGR) and other statutory authorities and organisational units that report to the Minister.

The following table details the appropriation for 2010-11 compared to the previous financial year for the **Portfolio of Tourism and Fair Trading**:

	2009-10 \$'000	2010-11 \$'000
Controlled Items		
<i>Departmental Services</i>	60,571	60,489
<i>Equity Adjustment</i>	(555)	(728)
Administered Items	56,376	51,980
Vote	116,392	111,741

Source: Department of Employment, Economic Development and Innovation

Key funding initiatives for the Department of Employment, Economic Development and Innovation within the Minister's portfolio in 2010-11, include:

Helping business and individuals respond to the economic challenges they face by:

- modernising and networking DEEDI service delivery by expanding regional services to reflect their comparative advantages of each region;
- integrating mobile service delivery and implementing the Department's own business improvement projects for ebusiness and online application, renewal and payment processes;
- reducing harm to individuals, families and the community through liquor regulatory initiatives, and work with other jurisdictions through the Ministerial Council on Gambling to progress national approaches to gambling harm minimisation;
- competitively positioning the tourism sector through delivering the grants targeting product and infrastructure development, including the \$500,000 Eco-tourism Places Development Grants; \$300,000 Tourism Projects Pre-feasibility Grants; and the \$600,000 Minor Tourism Grants Program; and
- delivering on the 3 year \$36 million commitment to help tourism industry counteract the impact of the Global Financial Crisis;

Creating the conditions for business success through:

- delivering the Racing Industry Capital Development Scheme which will provide over \$80 million over 4 years for the Queensland Racing Industry;
- supporting Tourism Queensland to implement the *Queensland Tourism Action Plan to 2012* by establishing a tourism attraction program to attract investment for tourism products and infrastructure in Queensland; tourism development in regional planning; and finalising the State-wide needs analysis and economic assessment of the mega and smaller expedition, adventure/boutique cruise ship markets; and
- expanding the use of digital and social networking tools to strengthen and build tourism growth in Queensland.

ISSUES CONSIDERED BY THE COMMITTEE

Issues the committee raised with the Minister at the public hearing on 22 July 2010 include:

- Queensland implementation of the Federal Government insulation scheme;
- Office of Fair Trading relationship with the Electrical Safety Office;
- Monitoring of the Federal Government solar power scheme;
- Decentralisation of OFT jobs/staff to Ipswich;

- PAMDA claim fund;
- The recall of the Happy Baby Dummy;
- OFT consumer protection achievements;
- Operation Turner – investigation into backyard motor dealers;
- National Reform Agenda – consumer protection laws;
- Ongoing work of the Product Safety Unit;
- Reforms in the area of manufactured home owners;
- Public education of consumer rights – especially for the younger generation;
- Consumer protection for persons in remote areas and indigenous communities;
- Remuneration of executive members of Racing Queensland;
- Funding for the Gold Coast Turf Club and Magic Millions Carnival;
- Anticipated Government response to the Alcohol Fuelled Violence inquiry;
- Liquor Licensing fees;
- Consumer protection in the liquor industry;
- The Queensland Household Gambling Survey;
- Funding for the Queensland racing industry;
- Amalgamation of racing codes into Racing Queensland;
- Protections put in place for country racing;
- Productivity Commission's gambling inquiry report and harm minimisation initiatives;
- Current OLGR initiatives to improve efficiency;
- The Gambling Community Benefit Fund;
- Funding for Tourism Queensland;
- Activities of the Chairman of Tourism Queensland;
- Tourism Queensland International Marketing activities;
- Tourism Queensland staffing arrangements and the sale of Sunlover Holidays;
- The impact of the global financial crisis on the Queensland tourism industry;
- The promotion of Queensland's natural attractions;
- Drive tourism throughout Queensland; and
- Initiatives to encourage creativity and support innovation within the Queensland tourism industry.

PORTFOLIO OF THE MINISTER FOR CLIMATE CHANGE AND SUSTAINABILITY

The Department of Environment and Resource Management (DERM) conserves, protects and manages the State's environment and natural resources for the benefit of all Queenslanders (SDS 3-157). Within the DERM structure, the Minister for Climate Change and Sustainability (CCS) is responsible for matters such as climate change and reducing the carbon footprint of Queenslanders, waste management systems and protecting and enhancing Queensland's natural environment.

The following table details the appropriation for 2010-11 compared to the previous financial year for the **Portfolio of Climate Change and Sustainability**:

	2009-10 \$'000	2010-11 \$'000
Controlled Items		
<i>Departmental Services</i>	458,157	440,632
<i>Equity Adjustment</i>	(21,100)	(25,997)
Administered Items	-	-
Vote	437,057	414,635

Source: Department of Environment and Resource Management

Key funding initiatives for the Department of Environment and Resource Management within the Minister's portfolio in 2010-11, include:

- \$15.9 million to implement the new industry focussed waste reform agenda – the Industry Waste Levy will apply from 2011-12 with an estimated revenue of \$379 million over 4 years.
- \$55.9 million over 5 years to build on the amounts already provided for programs to acquire and manage lands in order to increase national parks to 7.5% of the State by 2020;
- \$45.5 million over 5 years from 2010-11 with a focus on habitat restoration, to continue to deliver the Koala Response Strategy;
- continuation of the implementation of the *Great Barrier Reef Water Quality Protection Plan 2009*;
- DERM leading and coordinating State-wide initiatives to cut by one third Queensland's carbon footprint with reduced car and electricity use and waste to landfill; and
- \$3.5 million over 3 years to progress the World Heritage nomination for the Cape York Peninsula.

ISSUES CONSIDERED BY THE COMMITTEE

Issues the committee raised with the Acting Minister at the public hearing on 22 July 2010 include:

- Reduction of the average Queensland household carbon footprint;
- Electricity related greenhouse emissions;
- The take up of the ClimateSmart Home Service;
- The new Industry Waste Levy;
- Government electricity reduction programs;
- Preparation for a Federal Carbon Pollution Reduction Scheme;
- Expansion of National Park areas throughout the State;
- Protection of the Great Barrier Reef and Cape York Peninsula areas;
- Employment of Queensland Parks and Wildlife Service (QPWS) Rangers;
- QPWS pest management programs and fire management programs;
- The progress of the Reverse the Effect program;
- Preparation for the impact of Climate Change around the State;
- Queensland implementation of an Emissions Trading Scheme;
- Staffing changes within DERM as a result of machinery of government changes;
- Funding and operations of the ClimateSmart Centre of Excellence;
- Activities and operations of Ecofund;
- Capital works budget for, and services provided by DERM;
- The Great Walks of Queensland program;
- Infrastructure developments on Fraser Island;
- Results of the Fraser Island dingo population survey;
- Environmental monitoring of the LNG industry;
- Enforcement of environmental legislation and regulation in Queensland;
- Outcomes from the Koala Response Strategy;
- Illegal trade of Dugong and Turtle meat in North Queensland;
- Monitoring reef resilience – Great Barrier Reef Water Quality Protection Plan 2009;
- Innovations in sustainability and energy efficiency;
- Climate change research;
- Acquisition of rainforests and green lands;

- Results and frequency of audits of National Park facilities;
- The introduction of electric vehicles into the market; and
- Assisting businesses to cut their carbon footprint and reduce their costs.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

The committee recommends that the proposed expenditure, as detailed in the Appropriation Bill 2010, for the portfolios of:

- The Minister for Police, Corrective Services and Emergency Services;
- The Minister for Tourism and Fair Trading; and
- The Minister for Climate Change and Sustainability,

be agreed to by the Legislative Assembly without amendment.



Ms Mandy Johnstone MP

Chair

2 August 2010

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE G MEMBERSHIP	
Ms Mandy Johnstone MP	(Chair) Member for Townsville
Mr Ray Stevens MP	(Deputy Chair) Member for Mermaid Beach
Mr Glen Elmes MP	Member for Noosa
Mr Vaughan Johnson MP	Member for Gregory
Mr Steve Kilburn MP	Member for Chatsworth
Mr Evan Moorhead MP	Member for Waterford
Mrs Carryn Sullivan MP	Member for Pumicestone
SECRETARIAT	
Mr Brook Hastie (Research Director)	
Mr Michael Gorrige (Research Officer)	
Mrs Jenny North (Executive Assistant)	

Estimates Committee G

2010

Statements of Reservation

STATEMENT OF RESERVATION

Estimates Committee G

Vaughan Johnson MP

Shadow Minister for Police and Corrective Services

Ms Mandy Johnstone MP
Chair – Estimates Committee G
Parliament House
Brisbane 4000

Dear Ms Johnstone

I refer to the draft report for Estimates Committee G and submit my statement of reservation.

May I commend the Chair for her even-handed approach in the administration of his committee duties and express my gratitude to Research Director Mr Brook Hastie, Research Officer Michael Gorringer and his Executive Assistant Jenny North for their support.

General reservations with the Estimates Process

There are a number of general reservations to be made in relation to the Queensland Estimates Committee process:

- The structure of the Budget Papers, and in particular the Service Delivery Statements, do not provide sufficient detailed information to enable proper scrutiny of activities and expenditures undertaken by Government
- Insufficient time is allocated for hearings by Estimates Committees when considering particular portfolios
- Insufficient opportunities are provided for hearings by Estimates Committees throughout the year
- Opposition Members are provided with insufficient time during Estimates Committees Hearings to pursue issues
- There is a continued failure by Government Ministers to allow Public Servants and Statutory Officials who exercise direct responsibility for the conduct of activities to directly answer questions posed by Members
- No mechanism exists to require full, direct and honest answers to Questions on Notice
- No mechanism exists to require Ministers to fully, directly and honestly answer questions posed during Hearings

Specific reservations from the hearing with respect to Police and Corrective Services

- When asked why Task Force Argos arrested 37 more offenders on 115 more charges in 2009-10 than in 2008-09, the Minister's only explanation was to give a history lesson. Despite the Minister's claims that it was Labor that introduced so-called 'tough

- legislation' to monitor and supervise sex offenders in the community, the clear evidence is that these measures have not reduced the number of offenders detected.
- When questioned over the failure to deliver the number of promised traffic police staff, the Minister stated that full-time equivalent numbers is not a reflective measure of strength in the field. If this is the Minister's view, then full-time equivalent staff numbers should not be used as budget information, and more accurate information should be included instead.
 - The Minister chose to contradict himself when explaining the 650,000 hour decrease in police in-service training. The Minister claimed that significant addition training had been provided in the last 12 months, but the figures recorded in the budget papers did not reflect this claim.
 - The Minister's explanation for the increase in the number of personal safety offences was that these fluctuations are just normal background noise and again persisted with trying to point to overall trends. Such incidents are not merely raw data, but incidents that have impacted individual members of the community.
 - Under questioning, while the Minister claimed that Queensland Police deserved a decent pay rise, he could only mount a defence that the 2.5% offered by the Bligh Labor Government was what they deserved because the Police enterprise bargaining agreement expired after other Queensland public servants.
 - Like many Bligh Labor Government projects, the delays in the implementation of the I-TAS system were simply put down to a Government that underestimated the time and complexity to roll out the systems they have chosen. This lack of planning is a clear impediment to the delivery of many major projects by this government.
 - The Minister's justification for the massive increases in weapons licencing fees was that they still remained relatively comparable to other states is a sorry indictment of this government's approach to public finances. Clearly gone are the days when Queensland proudly boasted of being the low tax state.
 - In trying to explain why this Government has chosen to continue with an antiquated monitoring system, rather than more modern GPS-based devices, the Minister provided a disturbing admission that the only way to know what those on the dangerous sex offender list are actually doing is by continued surveillance, and not by the use of monitoring devices.
 - The grouping of corrective services in with emergency services limits the amount of time allocated for proper consideration of this important portfolio responsibility.

Specific reservations from the hearing with respect to Emergency Services

- I accept, to some degree, the Minister's argument in his answer to a question regarding staff to population ratios in the Fire and Rescue Service. The Minister argued that population growth is perhaps not as significant a driver of demand for Fire and Rescue services as it is for Police services or Ambulance services. The Minister did, however, agree that population growth was nonetheless an important factor and therefore I remain concerned that Fire and Rescue Service staffing levels are only proposed to increase at around one-third of the rate of population growth.

- It was very worrying that Department officials could not confirm whether the new ESCAD system was able to track addresses in retirement villages and/or residential gated estates or whether there were plans to enable it to do so. With more and more people living in retirement villages and gated estates, this sort of capability should be a priority. The Minister promised to follow up this issue and get back to the Opposition. I look forward to his response.
- The Minister gave a confusing answer when asked to justify the real recurrent funding cuts to volunteer organisations such as Surf Life Saving Queensland and the Volunteer Marine Rescue Association. The Minister seemed to deny such cuts occurred despite his own answer to a Question on Notice revealing recurrent funding was not keeping up with the CPI. I ask him to issue a correction to his answer to Question on Notice number 96 of 2010 if indeed the figures are inaccurate.
- In regards to questioning about recent reductions in Rural Fire Service volunteer numbers, the Minister did not appear to take the concerns seriously and spent most of his answer either attacking myself or muddying the waters by disputing the accuracy of historical figures for general volunteer numbers. I invite the Minister to set the record straight by publishing comparable historical and current figures on general volunteer numbers.
- In regards to questioning about rural fire service uniforms, the Minister appeared to mock the degree of importance of the question. Maintaining morale is very important for retaining and recruiting the volunteers that are critical in achieving the department's vision to support safe and secure communities.
- It is appreciated that the Department Officers present clearly had prepared for many more lines of questioning and it is regretted that the Estimates process does not allow for more of this detail to be raised. Barely half an hour of Opposition questioning for an Emergency Services budget of over \$1bn is entirely inadequate.

Signed

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Vaughan Johnson". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Vaughan Johnson MP
Member for Gregory
Shadow Minister for Police and Corrective Services

SHADOW MINISTER FOR TOURISM, FAIR TRADING AND RACING
MR RAY STEVENS MP
STATEMENT OF RESERVATIONS – FAIR TRADING, LIQUOR, GAMING AND
RACING AND TOURISM
ESTIMATES COMMITTEE G 2010

I would like to place on record my observations and reservations concerning the public hearing for Estimates Committee G for the portfolios of Tourism, Fair Trading and Racing. These will be explored in order of the following areas below.

Firstly I would like to take this opportunity to express my concern over the inadequacies of the Estimates Committee process and the length of time the committee had to question the Minister. With the time allocation of 2 ½ hours from 1.15pm to 3.45pm for the examination of the portfolios in question, Non-Government members were allocated half of this time, which allowed 1 ¼ hours, broken down into three 25 minute sections (1.Fair Trading, 2.Liquor, Gaming & Racing, 3.Tourism Queensland). These portfolio areas are far too important to allocate such little time for examination, considering, as the Minister stated, the tourism industry contributes, indirectly and directly, \$9.2 Billion dollars to the Queensland economy and the Racing industry \$2 Billion. (*NB There was also time taken out for the change over of Departmental Officers between portfolio areas)

As the examination of the Budget is done on behalf of all Queenslanders, as it is taxpayers' money that is being expended by the Government, I would urge the process to be improved to have a more balanced investigation on where money is being spent.

The other issue I would like to raise is the answering of questions. The Minister read all his answers and didn't specifically answer the questions that I had asked. For almost the entire process, the Minister read a Departmental brief on the subject that did not address specific questions, which were asked of him.

FAIR TRADING

With the Home Insulation Scheme being the most disastrously managed implementation and delivery of Government policy that Australia has ever seen, I questioned the Minister on his responsibility that his Office of Fair Trading has with monitoring of the scheme. His answer was inadequate and he will not take responsibility for the monitoring of a program that the Minter Ellison Report and the Allan Hawke Report confirmed was the responsibility of states and territories' Offices of Fair Trading.

Considering there were 4 deaths directly relating to the Home Insulation Program, of which 3 were in Queensland, I am concerned that the Minister shirked his responsibility for his part in the delivery and monitoring of the program.

I then asked the Minister about faulty solar panel installations and installers and he responded that*the Office of Fair Trading is of the view that the solar power scheme does not present the same level of consumer risk that was evident with the Federal Government's Home Insulation Scheme.....*therefore admitting there was a consumer risk with the Home Insulation Scheme, of which his Department was obviously not on top of because, if they were, maybe the three deaths could have been prevented. Maybe if the Minister had insisted on his departmental officers being trained to monitor the program adequately these circumstances might have been prevented. In Queensland, Minister Lawlor and Minister

Garratt are jointly responsible for aspects of the program and should own up to their responsibility for it.

RACING

The amalgamation of the three Racing codes and the remuneration of the Chairman and the Directors was the content of my first question on Racing to the Minister. The Minister answered that it was a matter for the Chief Executive of the Queensland Government Department for Racing. Therefore, if the Chief Executive is responsible for this and he reports to the Minister for Racing, this confirms that Racing in Queensland, with Racing Queensland being the main Racing entity, is the responsibility of the Minister and the Government.

This leads onto my next question, which highlights the lack of agreement the Gold Coast Turf Club and Racing Queensland have currently and specific fund allocation from the \$80 million of taxpayers for the re-development of the Gold Coast Turf Club for the Magic Millions Carnival. The Minister confirmed that*a significant part of it* (the \$80 million) *would*.....be allocated from the promised \$80 million.

I was concerned when the Minister gave a very non specific answer to my next question which was.....*what other non government body is given \$80 million by this Government without giving it an idea on how it will be expended*..... Surely the people of Queensland are entitled to know where their money is being spent.

LIQUOR

In regards to the Law, Safety & Justice Parliamentary Committee, 'Review into Alcohol Related Violence', I asked the Minister when will there be a Government response considering the Committee presented their Review to Parliament four months ago. The Minister explained to the Committee that the response from the Government will be imminent, although no indication was given as to how long is imminent.

In regards to my question on pro rata payments for the annual liquor licensing fees, the Minister explained that in certain circumstances businesses can apply to the Chief Executive. I would have thought processes would be in place to allow for this as part of standard payment alternatives.

GAMING

For the question on harm minimisation strategies, the Minister had only two minutes to answer, which didn't leave enough time for an in-depth and appropriate answer to be given. I asked whether the harm minimisation strategies had reduced the problem gamblers' rates any further; this was not answered sufficiently.

TOURISM

The portfolio area needed much more time to be examined by the Committee and I found that it far too short to thoroughly examine an industry which contributes \$9.2 Billion to the Queensland economy.

I am concerned that the Chairman of Tourism Queensland resides in Sydney and believe that maybe a Queenslander should have been selected as we never seem to see the Chairman in Queensland.

I would also like to take this opportunity to thank the Minister and his Departmental officers for their time in preparing well written and well rehearsed answers for the Minister to recite for the Estimates process and also members of Estimates Committee G and staff for their professional and effective execution of the process.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'R. A. Stevens', written in a cursive style.

Mr Ray Stevens MP
Shadow Minister For Tourism, Fair Trading and Racing
State Member for Mermaid Beach

STATEMENT OF RESERVATION

Estimates Committee G

Glen Elmes MP

Shadow Minister for Climate Change and Sustainability

Ms Mandy Johnstone MP
Chair – Estimates Committee G
Parliament House
Brisbane 4000

Dear Ms Johnstone

I refer to the draft report for Estimates Committee G and submit my statement of reservation.

May I commend the Chair for her even-handed approach in the administration of her committee duties and express my gratitude to Research Director, Mr. Brook Hastie, Research Officer, Michael Gorrington and Executive Assistant, Jenny North for their support.

General Reservations with the Estimates Process

There are a number of general reservations to be made in relation to the Queensland Estimates Committee process:

- The structure of the Budget Papers, and in particular the Service Delivery Statements, do not provide sufficient detailed current or comparable year on year information to enable proper scrutiny of activities and expenditures undertaken by Government
- Insufficient time is allocated for hearings by Estimates Committees when considering particular portfolios
- Insufficient opportunities are provided for hearings by Estimates Committees throughout the year
- Opposition Members are provided with insufficient time during Estimates Committees Hearings to pursue issues
- There is a continued failure by Government Ministers to allow Public Servants and Statutory Officials who exercise direct responsibility for the conduct of activities to directly answer questions posed by Members
- No mechanism exists to require full, direct and honest answers to Questions on Notice
- No mechanism exists to require Ministers to fully, directly and honestly answer questions posed during Hearings

Specific Reservations from the Hearing

There are a number of specific reservations to be made in relation to the Committee G hearings into the Climate Change and Sustainability portfolio:

- Budget papers make frequent reference to savings in energy use and reductions to carbon footprints that have been delivered by State Government programs. Despite being repeatedly asked to provide the evidence that was collected in order to substantiate these claims, the Acting Minister confirmed that household energy consumption had actually risen and reductions in emissions resulted from changes in fuel for energy generation indicating poor administration of the Climate Smart Home Service.
- The Acting Minister was unable to provide any clear evidence of data or information that has been collected from participants in these programs that resulted in these claimed reductions and savings. A program may be predicted to deliver a specific reduction, but unless measurements are undertaken, there is no way to support these claims.
- This lack of follow-up monitoring was also on display when questioned about the ClimateSmart Home Service. While the Acting Minister was happy to tell the committee of client satisfaction with the service, she was unable to answer the specific question of what, if any, audit had been conducted in homes that have undertaken this service in order to quantify the actual reductions in energy use.
- When questioned regarding the soon-to-be introduced waste levy, the Acting Minister was unable to explain what, if any, action would be taken in order to dissuade interstate dumpers from using Queensland's dump sites given that by 2015-16, the New South Wales' levy will be twice that of Queensland's.
- Despite being launched as a standalone business unit 17 months ago in January 2009, the excuse that Ecofund was at an early stage in its life was again wheeled out once again to explain the lack of transparency and accountability regarding its activities. Given the importance of bodies such as Ecofund to proposed legislation such as the *Environmental Protection and Other Acts Amendment Bill 2009*, the Acting Minister's inability to advise the committee of the fund's activities and reporting obligations and schedules are of grave concern in the interests of accountability.
- Perhaps one of the most disappointing aspects of the Acting Minister's performance during these committee hearings was her perpetuation of the Bligh Labor Government's denial of the major issues confronting the illegal poaching of dugong and turtle in North Queensland. Despite repeated reports and clear evidence, the Acting Minister continued to fail to investigate these claims and reports – referring to them at one stage as hearsay and, disingenuously, proposing that the Shadow Minister should conduct investigations which are her responsibility. Despite claiming it is a serious issue, she could not justify the Bligh Labor Government's failure to prosecute a single person since 2007 for illegal dugong and turtle fishing.
- Despite claiming that capital projects are allocated on a rolling basis, the Acting Minister failed to explain why capital projects that were announced in the pervious financial year had not been completed, on-time, in their previously allocated time-frame nor on-budget confirming the Bligh Labor Government's inability to manage financial responsibilities.
- The Acting Minister confirmed that the Bligh Labor Government has failed to commit any new money to rainforest and green land acquisitions in 2010-11. Any money that will be spent in this regard in 2010-11 is simply money that the Government failed to spend on acquisitions in the 2009-10 financial year.

- The Total Environment and Resource Management Capital Statement for 2009-10 listed a budgeted expenditure of over \$595 million. The Total Environment and Resource Management Capital Statement for 2010-11 listed a budgeted expenditure of \$455 million. This was \$140 million less than the last financial year. When queried on whether these decreases had come from matters under the administration of the Minister for Climate Change and Sustainability or the Minister for Natural Resources, Mines and Energy, the Estimates Committee was instead told that the capital program has in fact seen an increase of \$29.6 million – a clear contradiction to the budget papers.
- Despite blaming an “unfortunate delay” for the extremely slow uptake in the ‘Reverse the Effect’ program, the Acting Minister could not explain why only an additional 165 Queenslanders had become part of this program since it was revealed in April 2010 that only 230 Queenslanders had made voluntary payments to this program since its November 2009 launch. Despite being specifically asked, the Acting Minister could not inform the committee how much money the State Government had contributed as part of their \$4.5 million commitment to this program. Continuing to blame Queenslanders for this failure to deliver such programs simply demonstrates how out of touch this Government has become.

Signed

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Glen Elmes". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style with large, connected letters.

Glen Elmes MP
Member for Noosa
Shadow Minister for Climate Change and Sustainability